

Appendix 3

Public Consultation Responses for the addition of 2 new entries to the Council's Local List of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance (Nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane and The Paddington Packet Boat Public House)

Respondent ID No. and Summary of Consultation response.	Officer Response
<p>Nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane</p>	
<p>ID1 - Supports the inclusion of nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane to the Local list of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance.</p> <p>The parades are at the centre of the local community and their appearance gives character to the area. Any alteration or even worse demolition would lead to an inexorable decline in the identity of the area.</p>	<p>Noted</p>
<p>ID2 - Supports the inclusion of nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane to the Local list of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance.</p> <p>The terrace of shops add to the rich local history and character of the area. It does save a special place within the community.</p>	<p>Noted</p>
<p>ID3 - The local listing of nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane is not supported.</p> <p>These shop buildings are not particularly attractive. Given the built-up urban look of the local roads (A40) and station, these shops actually look out of place.</p> <p>The buildings would be better replaced by slightly larger, modern, energy efficient buildings. This would make better use of the urban land. Holding on to unremarkable buildings is limiting our ability to reduce the carbon intensity of the borough's buildings</p>	<p>Nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane have been assessed against the Council's Eligibility Criteria and scoring for Locally Listed Buildings (2009) and merit inclusion on the list.</p> <p>Any future alterations or redevelopment scheme would be assessed against Policy DMHB 3: Locally Listed buildings should the terrace of shops become locally listed buildings.</p>
<p>ID4 - Supports the inclusion of nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane to the Local list of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance.</p> <p>This parade of shops adds significantly to the character of the local area, with its wide roads of houses, built to a uniform pattern.</p>	<p>Noted</p>

<p>ID5 - Supports the inclusion of nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane to the Local list of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance.</p> <p>They provide a distinctive, positive image of the unique area of North Hillingdon, a contrast to the bland aspect of many local shopping parades.</p> <p>Consideration should also be given to the inclusion of the terrace on the opposite side of the street for inclusion on the register.</p>	<p>An assessment of other local buildings for inclusion on the local list could be undertaken as a separate study subject to approval work streams.</p>
<p>ID6 - Supports the inclusion of nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane to the Local list of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance.</p>	<p>Noted</p>
<p>ID7 – Supports the inclusion of both The Paddington Packet Boat Public House and nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane to the Local list of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance.</p> <p>Respondent thinks both need to be retained for Heritage reasons and should be given such status.</p> <p>The loss of such buildings can often result in a mess of buildings from different eras that have no consistency or cohesion which ruins a built environment. Both have several merits of build quality and having stood for so long.</p>	<p>Noted</p>
<p>ID8 – Supports the inclusion of nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane to the Local list of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance.</p> <p>This parade of shops at Hillingdon Circus and its design contributes significantly to local character of the area and was constructed around the same time as the Oak Farm Estate. Its appearance and scale as forming pleasant two-storey pitched roof design along the run of shops with consistent by varying pattern of mock Tudor frontages, is unaltered since the original build, and reflects local design elements and scale of the surrounding streetscape and area.</p>	<p>Noted</p>

<p>ID9 - Supports the inclusion of both The Paddington Packet Boat Public House and nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane to the Local list of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance.</p> <p>I have lived in the Borough all my life and love the historical buildings. They stand out from the rest and give the area character. They must be preserved.</p>	<p>Noted</p>
<p>ID10 - Supports the inclusion of both The Paddington Packet Boat Public House and nos. 305-315 and 317-327 Long Lane to the Local list of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance.</p> <p>Paddington Packet Boat should once again be at the heart of the community.</p> <p>Hillingdon Circus Shopping parade is at the heart of the community and is a well-recognised landmark for people when travelling to and from Hillingdon by road, rail or bus.</p>	<p>Noted</p>
<p>ID11 - As a resident, I would strongly support the local listing of both the Hillingdon shops and the Paddington Packet Boat Public House.</p> <p>The local recognition of these buildings as heritage assets would help preserve Hillingdon heritage.</p>	<p>Noted</p>
<p>ID12 – Does not support the addition of the Paddington Packet Boat to the Local List.</p> <p>The site is currently the subject of a full planning application for its redevelopment to provide much needed student accommodation for Brunel University (Application ref: 76795/APP/2021/3704). The public house, which was formally operated by Fullers, closed its doors in 2018, and the site has subsequently remained vacant and fallen into a state of disrepair. During this period the site has been consistently marketed, however the only genuine interest has been from other developers.</p>	<p>There is currently a planning application for the demolition of the public house and its redevelopment for student accommodation (76795/APP/2021/3704). The application has not yet been determined and is still under consideration.</p>

The Council has previously applied to have the site statutorily listed. Historic England concluded that the Paddington Packet Boat did not come close to warranting statutory listing, assessing that the building had not survived in a way that sufficiently reflected its original character and form, or demonstrated its historical connections. It is therefore difficult to comprehend how the Council has come to a different conclusion.

The current application for local listing is, we consider, an unfortunate attempt to hinder the current planning application for the redevelopment of the site, and is not good planning practice. The listing is clearly not being brought forward at this particular moment for sound reasons based on clear evidence (a view shared by Historic England). Rather it is an attempt to thwart a live planning application which has been subject to lengthy and constructive consultation with the local authority. The unfortunate reality is that were any Local Listing to have any influence on the outcome of the current application, then as well as an opportunity for high quality regeneration of an eye-sore site being lost, the site is likely to continue to sit vacant, falling further into a state of disrepair.

Our case is therefore that the site does not warrant Local Listing once the eligibility criteria are properly considered (see below), and that

This consultation is on locally listing and not on the merits of whether the building should be Statutory Listed. Historic England, as noted, did assess the building under an application from the Council to consider the building for statutory listing in 2019. It was concluded, for the reasons given, that it did meet the criteria for Statutory listing.

Statutory listing is different to local listing. The Local List of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance is compiled by the local authority and recognises buildings that are considered to be of local architectural and historic importance that contribute significantly to the unique character and sense of local distinctiveness of the Borough.

Local heritage assets are considered as non designated heritage assets under the NPPF and can include buildings, structures and features of local interest. They are an important element of the rich history of the Borough.

There have been a number of planning and pre-application applications for the site where the planning department has consistently stated that the building is considered to be a non-designated heritage asset.

Historic England in their assessment of the public house, when it was considered for Statutory listing, noted in their assessment report that *The Paddington Packet Boat Public House is acknowledged as a historic building which makes a positive contribution to this part of Cowley, and is a visible reminder of the C19 packet boat trade. The name of the pub clearly references the packet boat service that operated from 1801 to 1830 on the nearby canal, providing a passenger service on horse-drawn barges from Paddington Basin to Uxbridge.*

Local listing ensures that when a planning application is submitted to either alter or redevelop a non-designated heritage asset that

the timing of the proposed Listing does not amount to good planning.

For the reasons set out below, our client does not agree with the Council's conclusion that the Paddington Packet Boat public house should be added to the Local List.

The historic value of the building has been the subject of multiple studies by heritage experts in recent years, as documented in the following:

- Submission to Historic England re Listing Application, Montague Evans (August 2019);
- Historic England Advice Report Case Number 1465335, The Paddington Packet Boat Public House, Cowley (November 2019);
- Heritage Statement, Corrie Newell Historic Buildings Consultancy (July 2021).

The conclusions of the Historic England Advice Report following the Council's application for statutory listing provide a useful summary of the architectural and historic interest of the Paddington Packet Boat, as set out at page 3 of their report:

Architectural interest:

- numerous extensions and alterations have compromised the original architectural composition of the public house;
- the historic layout of the interior has not survived the accumulative changes, leaving very little evidence of its original plan form, or how it functioned;
- very little of the Georgian or Victorian fixtures and fittings or decorative schemes remain.

Degree of Historic interest:

- whilst it is acknowledged that there is a connection between the public house and the packet boat service, the building in its current

it is given the correct level of consideration within the planning process and would be assessed under Policy DMHB 3 Locally Listed Buildings.

The Paddington Packet Boat eligibility for local listing was assessed using the Council's Eligibility Criteria and scoring for Locally Listed Buildings (2009) and obtain a score of 6. A score of between 5 and 9 would merit inclusion on in the list (subject to Cabinet/Members approval. However, in the light of the additional information received regarding the deterioration of the building it is proposed a re-evaluation against the Council's Eligibility Criteria should be undertaken (subject to Cabinet/Member approval.

As previously stated, Statutory listing is different to local listing and are assessed under different criteria. The Local List of Buildings of Architectural or Historic Importance is compiled by the local authority and recognises buildings that are considered to be of local architectural and historic importance that contribute significantly to the unique character and sense of local distinctiveness of the Borough.

The Council notes the alterations that have occurred and that the building has origins ca. 1800. This can be traced back on historic maps. The building although not in its original built form and appearance is still a building that presents an attractive Victorian facade the character of which is of a mid to late-C19 public house that is important element of the rich history of the Borough and reinforces local distinctiveness and sense of place.

The building although not in its original built form and appearance it is still a building that presents an attractive Victorian facade the character of which is of a mid to late-C19 public house. The building is still an important

form does not afford a strong connection with this aspect of history.

These conclusions are at odds with those drawn by the Council in their Statement of Significance / Reasons for Designation document ('the Council's Statement'). We address each of the four criteria in turn below, and reference the Eligibility Criteria document as appropriate.

Authenticity

The Council's Statement recognises that the building is much altered, but that some original features are retained including the barge boards in gables and small paned first floor windows. The criteria has been scored 1-point, for c) 'some features retained'.

We can confirm that actually the barge boards in the gables were removed in 2021 due to serious safety concerns raised by local residents and the Council's Building Control department. At that time, a series of tiles were also removed from the roof. As confirmed in Historic England's Advice Report, 'very little of the Georgian or Victorian fixtures and fittings or decorative schemes remain'. We therefore contend that the building does not meet the threshold of 'some features retained' and that the authenticity criteria should be scored 0-points.

Architectural / Artistic Interest

The Council's Statement scores the building 1-point for criteria d), for being 'an example of a style of building that is unique to the local area or a good surviving example of an historic architectural style'. Given the conclusions drawn by Historic England, Montague Evans and Corrie Newell Historic Buildings Consultancy in their respective reports, we disagree with the score indicated. As described by Historic England, the building has been subjected to numerous extensions and alterations over time that have compromised

element of the rich history of the Borough and reinforces local distinctiveness and sense of place. The Victorian façade is substantial in its survival.

The building is not being put forward for local listing on the basis that it is a surviving early 19th century public house.

It is noted that the decorative barge boards have had the decorative pierced work removed and by this act some character has been lost. It is also noted that since the assessment some slates have been removed from the roof which have led to the building's more rapid deterioration. The photograph on the draft entry is therefore out of date and would require updating.

The survival of the Victorian façade, roof form and windows and decorative window head mouldings remain significant features but it is noted that the current listing makes specific reference to the barge boards and that a re-evaluation in light of their removal should be considered.

The Council's score of 1 is appropriate as the pub is a good surviving example of an historic architectural style within the Borough with a surviving Victorian pub façade and form with gabled cross wings with windows and window head detailing.

As previously stated, the building is not being put forward for local listing on the basis that it is an unaltered early 19th century building. Its alterations have been acknowledged and the building now has a distinctly Victorian character

the original architectural composition both in terms of its external appearance and plan form.

In conclusion, we disagree with the Council's score for architectural / artistic interest, and contend that the criteria should be scored 0-points.

Townscape Significance

The Council's Statement scores the townscape significance criteria 1-point, for its role as a key landmark building. We acknowledge that the building is noticeable on approach from the north, and could be described as having characteristics of a landmark building.

Historic / Archaeological Interest

The final criteria relates to Historic / Archaeological Interest, and the Council have scored the maximum total of 3-points, 2-points for criteria h) strong community or socio-economic development significance, such as schools, institutions or an important part of the Borough's industrial and Military history, and 1-point for association with an important historic figure, local or national; or important local historic events.

As described by Historic England in their Report, it is acknowledged that the building once had a connection to the Packet Boat passenger service that operated along the Grand Union Canal in the early 19th century. However, as they have concluded, the building in its current form does not afford a strong connection with this aspect of history, and therefore we cannot agree with Council's decision to score the building with the maximum total for the historic/archaeological interest criteria. A more suitable, generous score would be 2-points.

In conclusion, it is our view that the building does not meet sufficient criteria to warrant being included on the Local List. Based on our assessment, a revised score is included below:

As stated in the Council's assessment the public house is a landmark corner building set at an angle to the junction and is particularly noticeable when approaching from the north on Cowley Road. This familiar public house contributes to local character and street scene and has done for generations. The score of 1 is justified.

The building is an historically interesting public house first licensed in 1804 to service the Paddington Packet Boat passenger service which docked at the nearby Grand Union Canal and ran between 1801 and the 1830s. Remained of communal value as a public house until recent closure. Has socio-economic development significance and strong community value and is connected to the Borough's industrial history.

The alterations to the building are acknowledged, however, this has not diminished its historic interest and its past associations. The score of 2 for its strong community or socio-economic development significance is justified along with its association with the historic packet boat trade on the Grand Union Canal. A score of 1 is therefore appropriate in this case giving a score of 3.

Authenticity (I c): 0; Architectural (II d): 0;
Townscape (III g); 1; Historic (IV h, i); 1+1 Total
= 3-points

A score of 3 would not meet the Council's
internal thresholds for inclusion on the Local
List.

As concluded by a range of independent
heritage experts, including Historic England, the
Paddington Packet Boat Public House has not
survived in a way that sufficiently reflects its
original character and form, or demonstrates its
historical connections with the packet boat
service. The building therefore does not
warrant listing at either statutory or local level.
We recommend that the site is withdrawn from
consideration.

As outlined above the Council's assessment the
scoring was considered appropriate for this
non-designated heritage asset. However, in the
light of the additional information received
regarding the deterioration of the building it is
proposed a re-evaluation against the Council's
Eligibility Criteria should be undertaken (subject
to Cabinet/Member approval).